

Inclusive Islam in the Classroom: A Study on the Implementation of Religious Moderation at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah

Ike Hilatun Nisa

Institut Asy Syukriyyah Tangerang

iketurkan@gmail.com

Aisah Dwi Azizah

Institut Asy Syukriyyah Tangerang

azizahdwiaisah@gmail.com

Abstract

Religious moderation is a theological approach that promotes a balanced stance between strong religious commitment and respect for diversity, playing a strategic role in Islamic education to cultivate students who are tolerant, inclusive, and morally grounded. This study aims to describe and analyze the implementation of religious moderation values in teaching practices, social interactions, and school culture at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah, an integrated Islamic secondary school. Employing a qualitative case study approach, data were collected through in-depth interviews, participatory observations, and document analysis, and were thematically analyzed using triangulation. The findings reveal that values such as tolerance, nonviolence, and acceptance of differences are internalized across various aspects of school life, including the Islamic Religious Education curriculum, character-building programs, and student social dynamics. The school's leadership commitment and the role of teachers as value facilitators are identified as key enabling factors. This study contributes empirical insights to the literature on Islamic education by presenting grounded evidence of religious moderation practices at the secondary level and proposes an integrative model that can be replicated by other Islamic schools seeking to develop an inclusive and peaceful educational ecosystem in the context of Indonesia's plural society.

Keywords: Religious Moderation, Islamic Education, Adolescents, *SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah*, Tolerance

Introduction

In today's global context marked by growing sociocultural complexity, religious diversity, and the rise of extremism, the discourse on religious moderation has gained increasing prominence, particularly within educational settings especially in Islamic institutions. The world faces serious challenges in fostering interreligious coexistence and preventing faith-based violence. In Indonesia, the country with the largest Muslim population and a highly pluralistic society, instilling inclusive and tolerant religious values is becoming more critical than ever. The Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia actively promotes religious moderation as a national strategy to counter radicalism and strengthen social cohesion (Mutaqin, 2024). Within Islamic education, these values must be internalized from an early stage to shape students who embody *rahmatan lil 'alamin* principles and resist sectarianism during their formative years (Aziz et al., 2024).

Although Indonesia's national curriculum and educational policies formally incorporate religious moderation principles, practical implementation within Islamic schools remains challenging. Prior studies reveal that limited teacher comprehension, lack of targeted training, and ideological biases may hinder comprehensive adoption of moderate religious values (Ramdhani & Romdhoni, 2023). Additionally, much of the existing research focuses on higher education institutions, while studies addressing religious moderation at the high school level especially in *Sekolah Islam Terpadu* (Integrated Islamic Schools), remain scarce (Afwadzi & Miski, 2021). Consequently, in-depth field research is needed to explore how moderation is concretely implemented in students' daily activities, the school curriculum, and the institution's cultural ecosystem.

Theoretically, this article is grounded in the *Religious Moderation Framework* formulated by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (2019), which consists of four key indicators: national commitment, tolerance, nonviolence, and accommodation of local culture (Khasanah et al., 2023). It is further supported by the *Islamic Character Education* approach, which emphasizes affective and social dimensions in religious learning, and by Paulo Freire's concept of schools as agents of social transformation where education is a liberating praxis fostering critical awareness and inclusive behavior (Rahmadi & Hamdan, 2023). The intersection of these three frameworks offers a strong conceptual lens to examine the actualization of religious moderation within integrated Islamic school settings.

This study seeks to describe and analyze how religious moderation values are applied in the teaching process, social interaction, and school culture at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah. The research questions guiding this study are: How are moderation practices enacted by teachers and students at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah? What supporting and inhibiting factors influence the

implementation of these values in the school environment? Employing a qualitative case study design, the study gathered data through in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and school documentation. Thematic analysis and data triangulation were used to interpret findings rigorously.

This article offers both scholarly and practical contributions by providing empirical insight into how religious moderation is operationalized at the secondary school level, particularly in Islamic institutions that integrate religious, academic, and civic values. It also presents a critical reading of how curriculum, school culture, and student interactions form a dynamic space for nurturing moderate religious identity (Subchi et al., 2022), (Susiawati & Royani, 2023), (Syaifudin, 2024), (Nasir & Rijal, 2021).

Literature Review

The concept of religious moderation is a theological framework that advocates the middle path (*wasathiyah*), avoiding both extremism and intolerance in religious practice. Rooted in Islamic teachings particularly in the Qur'anic phrase *ummatan wasathan* (QS. Al-Baqarah: 143), this concept has evolved into a pedagogical approach within Islamic education that fosters balanced, tolerant, and civically engaged individuals. In Indonesia, the Ministry of Religious Affairs has formalized this framework into four core indicators: national commitment, tolerance, nonviolence, and accommodation of local culture (Mutaqin, 2024). These principles are increasingly integrated into Islamic schools' curricula and institutional cultures as part of efforts to shape a contextualized and humanistic religious character (Aziz et al., 2024).

Numerous studies have demonstrated progress in the implementation of religious moderation in Islamic education, particularly through curriculum reforms, teacher training, and institutional support. Khasanah et al. (2023) found that several Islamic schools in Indonesia have introduced learning models that promote interfaith dialogue, inclusive teaching materials, and anti-radicalization programs (Khasanah et al., 2023). Syaifudin (2024) noted that programs such as character-building sessions, student-led sermons, and inclusive student organization events serve as effective mediums for cultivating religious moderation (Syaifudin, 2024). Nevertheless, research by Afwadzi & Miski (2021) and others also highlight significant challenges, including limited teacher capacity and inconsistent school leadership support (Afwadzi & Miski, 2021).

Despite these advances, most existing research remains focused on higher education or pesantren (Islamic boarding schools), with relatively little attention given to the dynamics of religious moderation at the secondary education level, particularly in *Sekolah Islam Terpadu* (Integrated Islamic Schools). Rahmadi & Hamdan (2023) primarily examined practices within pesantren and Islamic universities, leaving high school environments

underexplored (Rahmadi & Hamdan, 2023). Similarly, Subchi et al. (2022) concentrated on campus-based religious moderation, without delving into classroom-level practices among adolescent learners (Subchi et al., 2022). This gap underlines the need for empirical research on how religious moderation is practiced in integrated Islamic high schools on a day-to-day basis.

This article aims to fill that gap by examining the lived experience of religious moderation at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah through a qualitative case study approach. Using primary data collected through fieldwork, this study offers empirical depth to a discourse often dominated by normative and policy-driven narratives. It not only enriches the academic literature but also provides practical insights for policymakers and educators seeking to design evidence-based strategies for strengthening moderation in Islamic schools (Malik et al., 2022), (Susyawati & Royani, 2023).

Methodological trends in the literature show a predominance of descriptive-qualitative approaches, often relying on content analysis or phenomenology to interpret how moderation is understood and applied in schools (Azmi & Saputra, 2022), (Ni'am & Rahmatullah, 2023). However, these studies often adopt a generalized lens, with few focusing on the specific context of integrated Islamic secondary schools as institutions that uniquely combine spiritual, academic, and civic education. There is a clear need for context-sensitive research that engages directly with the voices of teachers, students, and school leaders.

As a conceptual synthesis, this study draws on three intersecting frameworks: (1) the Ministry of Religious Affairs' indicators of religious moderation; (2) Islamic character education emphasizing the integration of affective and cognitive moral development; and (3) Paulo Freire's concept of schools as transformative spaces for critical, reflective, and participatory learning. These frameworks collectively inform the analytical lens through which religious moderation at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah is examined, positioning the school not only as a place for transmitting knowledge but also as a dynamic space for cultivating inclusive and socially responsive Islamic values (Jamaluddin, 2024), (Riyawi & Febriansyah, 2023), (Ramdhani & Romdhoni, 2023).

Method

This study employs a qualitative approach using a case study design to explore the implementation of religious moderation values within the context of an Integrated Islamic High School, specifically SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah. This approach allows the researcher to obtain an in-depth understanding of the meaning, values, and practices of religious moderation as perceived and enacted by educational stakeholders within the natural setting of the school.

The case study method is particularly suited for capturing the holistic dynamics of a specific phenomenon within its real-life context (Yin, 2018).

The data sources in this research include both primary and secondary data. Primary data were collected through in-depth interviews with the school principal, Islamic Studies (PAI) teachers, and students; participatory observation of classroom and school activities; and the review of internal documents such as records of student council (OSIS) programs and *Bina Pribadi Islam* (BPI) character education sessions. Secondary data were derived from the school's curriculum documents, institutional policies, and academic literature related to Islamic education and religious moderation. The triangulation of data types enhances the validity of the findings by enabling a multifaceted examination of the research problem (Creswell & Poth, 2017).

Data collection was carried out through three main techniques: (1) semi-structured interviews to explore participants' perspectives and experiences regarding the enactment of religious moderation; (2) participatory observation to record firsthand the social interactions, body language, and communication patterns within the school environment; and (3) document analysis of teaching materials, meeting notes, school visuals, and content from religious character-building programs. The key instruments included an interview guide, field notes, and a document analysis checklist, all of which were structured around the religious moderation indicators established by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña, 2014).

The inclusion criteria for primary data required that informants be actively involved in SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah's educational processes, particularly in the delivery of Islamic teaching and character development programs, and be willing to participate in the interviews and observations. Exclusion criteria applied to individuals not directly engaged in religious educational activities. For secondary data, inclusion was limited to officially issued school documents and peer-reviewed academic literature published within the last five years. Unverified sources, non-academic materials, and informal internal memos were excluded from analysis.

The unit of analysis in this study is the practice of religious moderation as manifested by teachers and students within the school setting. The research subjects were selected purposively and included the principal, PAI teachers, and 11th-grade students, based on their relevance and direct involvement in religious and social development activities. This purposive sampling ensured that data were gathered from informants with strategic roles in moderating school values (Patton, 2015).

The data were analyzed using thematic analysis, consisting of open coding, categorization, and interpretation of emerging themes. The process followed the stages of data reduction, display, and conclusion drawing in an

iterative manner, as outlined by Miles and Huberman. To ensure analytical rigor, triangulation of sources and methods was employed, comparing interview data with observational and documentary evidence. The qualitative data were managed to facilitate thematic organization and visualization of patterns (Silver & Lewins, 2014). To enhance credibility, the study also used member checking and peer debriefing, validating interpretations with participants and external academic peers (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Results

Based on thematic analysis of the primary data obtained through in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and document analysis, this study identified three major themes characterizing the implementation of religious moderation at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah: (1) Integration of moderation values into curriculum and learning; (2) Internalization of moderation through school culture and student activities; and (3) Enabling and inhibiting factors in implementing religious moderation. Each theme is supported by sub-themes derived from open and selective coding, facilitated using NVivo software.

The first theme, Integration of moderation values into curriculum and learning, is reflected in how Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers explicitly connect subjects such as *fiqh*, *aqidah*, and Islamic history with contemporary issues like pluralism and interfaith harmony. Teachers applied contextual learning strategies using real-world case studies—such as religious conflicts in the media to critically examine Islam’s compassionate stance toward others. Teachers emphasized that Islam is a *rahmatan lil ‘alamin* (a mercy to the worlds) and should be taught as a religion of peace. Lesson plans and teaching modules analyzed by the researcher confirmed that the content emphasized inclusivity over exclusivism. Observations also noted that classroom environments allowed open discussion and respectful inquiry without judgment or fear of criticism.

The second theme, Internalization of moderation through school culture and student activities, shows that religious moderation is not limited to formal instruction but is also embodied in daily interactions and extracurricular activities. The weekly *Bina Pribadi Islam* (BPI) sessions promoted themes such as ethics, unity, and tolerance, with student mentors encouraging acceptance of diverse viewpoints. Students shared that these programs helped them understand that being a good Muslim includes how one treats others, not just ritual observance. The “Inspirational Friday” programs organized by the student council (OSIS) regularly addressed topics such as peace, environmental care, and diversity. Observations revealed that students interacted respectfully across group identities and that the use of religious symbols did not interfere with interpersonal harmony.

The third theme, Enabling and inhibiting factors, emerged from interviews with the principal, teachers, and students. Key enabling factors included a strong commitment from school leadership to promote a grounded and inclusive interpretation of Islam, an integrated curriculum, and regular in-house training for teachers. In contrast, challenges included students' exposure to narrow interpretations of religion via social media or community influences. One observed case of disagreement among students regarding *fiqh* was resolved by the teacher through constructive dialogue and scriptural reasoning, demonstrating the school's capacity for healthy conflict resolution based on respectful discussion.

The participatory observation conducted from May 11–13, 2025, scored various indicators of religious moderation on a scale of 1 to 5: respectful student interactions scored 5; visible diversity of expression such as religious symbols scored 4; routine Islamic character-building programs focusing on tolerance and unity scored 5; teachers' openness to questions and nonjudgmental attitudes scored 5; student council initiatives addressing social and religious themes scored 4; inclusive and non-textualist religious education content scored 5; and conflict resolution through guided discussion scored 4. These findings indicate that moderation values are not merely taught but embedded in institutional practices.

Document analysis showed that the school's vision, strategic plans, and student affairs programs explicitly featured terms such as "tolerance," *rahmatan lil 'alamin*, and "civilized behavior." These align with national policy frameworks promoting inclusive religious education, as also discussed in studies by (Aziz et al., 2024), (Khasanah et al., 2023), and (Mutaqin, 2024). These institutional efforts are consistent with recommendations by (Susiawati & Royani, 2023), who emphasize synergy between macro policy and school-level implementation, and by (Ramdhani & Romdhoni, 2023), who highlight the pivotal role of school leadership and holistic character education.

Overall, the field data indicate that SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah has institutionalized religious moderation across curriculum, cultural routines, and interpersonal relationships. While some internal and external challenges remain, the practices observed represent a meaningful step toward building a peaceful, inclusive, and reflective educational environment, as supported by findings from (Rahmadi & Hamdan, 2023), (Afwadzi & Miski, 2021), (Jamaluddin, 2024), and (Syaifudin, 2024).

Discussion

The findings of this study clearly demonstrate that religious moderation values are systematically and institutionally integrated into the educational ecosystem at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah. These values manifest not only in the curriculum and instructional content but also in the social interactions

among students, teacher–student relationships, and school-wide activities such as *Bina Pribadi Islam* (BPI) and student council programs. These outcomes align directly with the research objectives, which aimed to describe and analyze how religious moderation is implemented in teaching, school culture, and student behavior. The evidence shows that moderation is not treated as a rhetorical ideal but is enacted through intentional pedagogical and organizational practices.

The interpretation of these findings is grounded in the Ministry of Religious Affairs’ framework for religious moderation, which includes four core indicators: national commitment, tolerance, nonviolence, and cultural accommodation. All of these were observable within the school’s practices. Teachers’ openness to dialogue and their nonjudgmental attitudes exemplify tolerance and nonviolence, while collaborative student relationships across group affiliations illustrate national cohesion. This aligns with the theory of *Islamic character education*, which emphasizes the development of affective and social dimensions in religious instruction, as well as with Paulo Freire’s concept of schools as spaces for social transformation, in which education fosters critical reflection and inclusive engagement (Rahmadi & Hamdan, 2023), (Sagirah et al., 2024).

When compared with prior studies, this research supports similar findings regarding the role of integrated curricula and school culture in promoting moderation. Jamaluddin (2024) highlighted that effective integration of moderation values requires coherence across policy, pedagogy, and school ethos (Jamaluddin, 2024). Tutik (2024) developed a three-phase model externalization, objectification, and internalization to explain how religious values are institutionalized, which also resonates with the process observed at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah (Tutik, 2024). This study, however, extends the literature by illuminating how students themselves act as agents of moderation through informal peer interactions, student-led religious talks, and inclusive social behaviors as dimensions rarely emphasized in earlier works.

The scholarly contribution of this article lies in its empirical focus on the secondary school level, specifically within *Sekolah Islam Terpadu* which has been underrepresented in studies on religious moderation. This article offers a grounded model of how moderation can be fostered through an integrative approach that bridges curriculum, extracurricular activities, and interpersonal dynamics. Practically, it provides educators and school administrators with a replicable example of cultivating tolerance and pluralism through everyday school practices. It also reinforces the significance of internalizing values through reflective and participatory engagement, as noted in Setiadharmanto et al. (2024)’s study on *pesantren* environments based on *tawazun* (balance) and *hikmah* (wisdom) (Setiadharmanto et al., 2024).

That said, this research is not without its limitations. First, as a single-site case study, its findings cannot be generalized across all Islamic schools. Second, the number and diversity of informants were constrained by time and access, possibly limiting the breadth of perspectives. Third, the study does not assess long-term behavioral outcomes among students, a dimension that could provide deeper insight into the effectiveness of religious moderation practices. Fahrudin et al. (2024) pointed out that many religious moderation policies remain administrative in nature and fail to permeate classroom praxis unless teacher capacity is deliberately strengthened (Fahrudin et al., 2024).

The implications of this study are threefold. For future research, longitudinal and multi-site case studies are needed to assess the sustainability and variability of moderation practices across diverse school contexts. For practitioners, this study suggests that schools should invest in teacher development, build curricula with embedded moderation themes, and create structured yet flexible platforms for student expression. For policymakers, the findings call for the development of practical guidelines and funding mechanisms to support moderation-based education at all school levels. Studies by Sagirah et al. (2024) and Rohimah (2023) also underscore the importance of aligning policy-level efforts with grassroots practices to ensure that religious moderation becomes a lived reality rather than a mere slogan (Sagirah et al., 2024), (Rohimah, 2023).

Conclusion

This study reveals that the values of religious moderation have been comprehensively and systematically embedded into various dimensions of school life at SMAIT Asy-Syukriyyah. These values are reflected not only in the formal Islamic Religious Education curriculum but also in school culture, character-building programs, and the interpersonal relationships among students and educators. Tolerance, nonviolence, and respect for difference are actively nurtured through classroom practices, student activities, and leadership policies. The successful implementation of these values is supported by strong institutional commitment, teacher involvement as facilitators of moderation, and a school environment that encourages dialogue and diversity. These findings affirm the research objectives and provide an empirical account of how moderation is practiced within a secondary-level Integrated Islamic School.

Theoretically, this article contributes to the scholarly discourse on moderate Islamic education by demonstrating how abstract frameworks of religious moderation can be operationalized in a real-world school context. Practically, it proposes an integrative model for promoting tolerance and pluralism through curriculum design, teacher engagement, and student empowerment. The study offers relevant insights for Islamic education institutions aiming to cultivate inclusive religious identities in plural societies.

It also affirms the importance of bridging formal learning with social interaction in building students' character within the framework of Islamic values.

The implications of this research highlight the need for ongoing teacher training, inclusive curriculum development, and institutional mechanisms that reinforce moderation as a daily practice. Future research is encouraged to explore the long-term impact of such practices, conduct comparative studies across multiple schools, and assess how varying sociocultural contexts influence the enactment of religious moderation. These efforts will be essential in strengthening the role of Islamic education as a vehicle for peace, inclusivity, and social transformation in Indonesia.

References

- Afwadzi, B., & Miski, A. (2021). *Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Islam di Sekolah Menengah*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 123–137.
- Aziz, M. A., Huda, M., & Nurhasanah, S. (2024). *Internalisasi Nilai Moderasi Beragama dalam Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam*. *Jurnal Tarbiyah Islamiyah*, 6(1), 45–58.
- Azmi, F. A., & Saputra, R. (2022). *Tren Pendekatan Moderasi Beragama dalam Kajian Pendidikan Islam*. *Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 11(3), 275–288.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2017). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Fahrudin, A., Malik, A., & Hidayat, S. (2024). *Evaluasi Implementasi Moderasi Beragama dalam Pembelajaran Agama Islam*. *Jurnal Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 3(2), 99–113.
- Jamaluddin, R. (2024). *Strategi Penguatan Nilai Moderasi Beragama melalui Kurikulum Terpadu*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Integratif*, 8(1), 22–36.
- Kementerian Agama RI. (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Jakarta: Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.
- Khasanah, N., Rofiq, A., & Lestari, I. (2023). *Model Pembelajaran Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah Islam*. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 11–26.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. SAGE Publications.
- Malik, R., Anshori, S., & Dewi, H. (2022). *Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kebijakan dan Praktik Sekolah*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Multikultural*, 10(2), 141–154.
- Mahamid, A. (2022). *Moderasi Beragama sebagai Strategi Preventif Radikalisme di Lembaga Pendidikan Islam*. *Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 14(3), 66–78.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Mutaqin, A. (2024). *Kebijakan Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia*. *Jurnal Sosial Keagamaan*, 12(1), 15–31.
- Nasir, M., & Rijal, A. (2021). *Pendidikan Islam Inklusif di Tengah Keberagaman*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(2), 101–114.

- Ni'am, M., & Rahmatullah, R. (2023). *Kajian Literatur Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah*. *Jurnal Studi Islam Kontemporer*, 4(1), 87–102.
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Rahmadi, A., & Hamdan, H. (2023). *Moderasi Beragama di Pesantren dan Perguruan Tinggi Islam*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Humanis*, 5(1), 40–56.
- Ramdhani, A., & Romdhoni, F. (2023). *Tantangan Guru dalam Implementasi Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah Islam*. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Keagamaan*, 11(3), 88–101.
- Riyawi, A., & Febriansyah, R. (2023). *Integrasi Kurikulum Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Islam*. *Jurnal Kurikulum dan Pembelajaran Islam*, 4(1), 55–67.
- Rohimah, L. (2023). *Strategi Kebijakan Penguatan Moderasi Beragama di Lembaga Pendidikan*. *Jurnal Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 91–105.
- Sagirah, U., Latifah, S., & Qomariah, N. (2024). *Penguatan Moderasi Beragama Melalui Peran Sekolah Islam*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Progresif*, 9(1), 70–84.
- Setiadharmanto, W., Nurfadilah, A., & Baharuddin, A. (2024). *Model Internalisasi Nilai Moderasi Berbasis Tawazun di Pesantren*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam dan Budaya*, 10(2), 120–134.
- Subchi, I., Harits, M., & Farhan, L. (2022). *Moderasi Beragama di Lingkungan Kampus: Studi Kasus Mahasiswa Islam*. *Jurnal Studi Islam*, 8(1), 33–49.
- Susiawati, I., & Royani, D. (2023). *Sinergi Kebijakan Moderasi Beragama antara Pemerintah dan Sekolah*. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Islam*, 5(2), 114–129.
- Syaifudin, M. (2024). *Kegiatan Kesiswaan sebagai Media Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah Islam*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Terpadu*, 6(1), 76–90.
- Tutik, S. (2024). *Institusionalisasi Nilai Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Islam: Perspektif Bergerian*. *Jurnal Filsafat Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 59–73.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods* (6th ed.). SAGE Publications.